

Philosophische Texte und Studien

Band 101

Carmen Dragonetti

Fernando Tola

Essays on Indian Philosophy
in Comparative Perspective

Carmen Dragonetti

Fernando Tola

Essays on Indian Philosophy
in Comparative Perspective



Georg Olms Verlag
Hildesheim · Zürich · New York
2009



Georg Olms Verlag
Hildesheim · Zürich · New York
2009

This work and all articles and pictures involved are protected by copyright.
Application outside the strict limits of copyright law without consent
having been obtained from the publishing firm is inadmissible.
These regulations are meant especially for copies, translations and micropublishings
as well as for storing and editing in electronic systems.

Das Werk ist urheberrechtlich geschützt. Jede Verwertung außerhalb der engen Grenzen
des Urheberrechtsgesetzes ist ohne Zustimmung des Verlages unzulässig.
Das gilt insbesondere für Vervielfältigungen, Übersetzungen, Mikroverfilmungen und
die Einspeicherung und Verarbeitung in elektronischen Systemen.

Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the
Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available
in the Internet at <http://dnb.ddb.de>.

Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek verzeichnet diese Publikation
in der Deutschen Nationalbibliografie; detaillierte bibliografische Daten
sind im Internet über <http://dnb.ddb.de> abrufbar.

Contents

Preface XV

Chapter I

The fundament of the ontological proof and Bhartṛhari

<i>Introduction</i>	1
<i>The ontological proof and the cultural dogmas</i>	2
<i>The ontological proof in the West</i>	4
<i>Refutation of the ontological proof: Gaunilo, Saint Thomas, Kant</i>	6
<i>The distinction in intellectu / in re in Bhartṛhari</i>	13
<i>The ontological proof and its consequences for Indian theism</i>	16
References	17

Chapter II

Indian and Western theories of categories. *Svarūpavattva / entelechy / exsistentia*



Gedruckt auf säurefreiem und alterungsbeständigem Papier
Umschlaggestaltung: Inga Günther, Hildesheim
Herstellung: rewi druckhaus, 57537 Wissen
Alle Rechte vorbehalten
Printed in Germany
© Georg Olms Verlag AG, Hildesheim 2009
www.olms.de
ISBN 978-3-487-13978-4
ISSN 0175-9574

Introduction 19

I

Aim, nature and criterion of classification of the categories as established by the Indian philosopher Kaṇāda 20

II

Aim, nature and criterion of classification of the categories as established by Aristotle 24

III

The primacy of language in cognition: Bhartṛhari, Hobbes and Leibniz 31

IV

Kinds of words used in the theory of categories: the Vaiśeṣika system, Bhartṛhari and Aristotle 34

V

Truth and falsity in categories 35

VI

The notions of astitva in Vaiśeṣika theory of categories, οὐσία / εἶδος / ἐντελέχεια in Aristotle, and exsistentia in Marius Victorinus 38

Conclusions 45

References 47

Chapter III

Aristotle and Praśastapāda on the genesis of the *universals*

Introduction 53

Definition of sāmānya / universal 53

Sāmānya: similarity, commonness 54

Similarity and commonness in Aristotle and Hobbes 56

Genesis of the universals according to Praśastapāda 57

The genesis of the principia prima and universals in Aristotle 60

Example of Themistius illustrating Aristotle's genesis of the principia prima 63

Final remarks 63

References 68

Chapter IV

On spontaneous generation: Buddhism, Praśastapāda and Aristotle

Introduction 71

I. BUDDHISM
Buddhist texts on spontaneous generation 73

The Majjhima Nikāya and the Dīgha Nikāya Pāli Suttas 73

The Abhidharmakośa and the Mahāvastu-avadāna Sanskrit texts 75

Remarks on the previous Buddhist texts 76

Beings born from moisture are born from a cause 76

Karman as the remote and principal cause of rebirth 77

Despicable characteristics of beings born from moisture 78

Arising process, examples and places of birth of beings born from moisture 78

<i>The opapātika (Pāli)/aupapāduka or upapāduka (Sanskrit) beings</i>	79
<i>Other conception on the yonis that seem of later origin</i>	80
<i>A wrong interpretation of opapātika and the other related words</i>	82
II. PRAŚASTAPĀDA	
<i>The yonis theory in Praśastapāda</i>	83
<i>Remarks on Praśastapāda's text</i>	85
<i>Atheistic and theistic positions on karman and the union of atoms</i>	85
<i>Praśastapāda and Gassendi</i>	86
III. ARISTOTLE	
<i>Aristotle on spontaneous generation</i>	86
<i>Aristotle's classification of modes of generation</i>	86
<i>Remarks on Aristotle's modes of generation</i>	87
<i>Coincidence between Aristotle fourth group and Buddhist third group</i>	87
<i>Examples of beings produced by spontaneous generation</i>	88
<i>Places where beings produced by spontaneous generation are found</i>	88
<i>Size of beings spontaneously generated</i>	89
<i>First explanation of spontaneous generation in Metaphysics 1034^b4-7: Two problematic consequences involved in it</i>	90
<i>Second explanation of spontaneous generation in De generatione animalium 762^a8-12, and 762^a18-27</i>	93
<i>A marginal note on Aristotle's animistic approach</i>	96
<i>Third explanation of spontaneous generation in De generatione animalium 737^a3-5</i>	97

<i>Fourth explanation of spontaneous generation in Meteorologica 379^b6-8</i>	97
<i>The problem of the diversity of species in spontaneous generation</i>	98
IV. FINAL REMARKS	
<i>Deficiencies, prejudices, mixture of intervening factors and motives of the research in the explanation of spontaneous generation</i>	100
<i>Buddhism</i>	102
<i>Praśastapāda</i>	104
<i>Aristotle</i>	105
<i>References</i>	110
Chapter V	
Udayana, the Cārvākas, and Hume on causality	
<i>Introduction</i>	115
<i>Five Cārvākas' objections to the existence of God. First reference to the notion of causality</i>	116
<i>Indian notion of cause</i>	117
<i>Buddhist conception of causality in terms of "invariable concomitance of being and not-being"</i>	118
<i>Galileo's definition of cause</i>	118
<i>The Cārvāka first argument against the existence of God: The denial of a "supernatural cause" for the "other world"</i>	119
<i>Udayana's reasons for rejecting the Cārvāka first argument against the existence of God</i>	120

<i>Udayana's first reason for rejecting the Cārvāka first argument against the existence of God: Occasionality of the world as a proof of the necessity of a cause for the world</i>	121
<i>Reference to Dharmakīrti by Udayana's commentator in support of Udayana's assertion on the tight connection between occasionality and causality</i>	124
<i>Whatever comes to existence has a cause. Hume's reference to this matter</i>	126
<i>The Cārvāka's position in regard to occasionality</i>	127
<i>The Cārvāka's denial of causality</i>	127
<i>Vardhamānopādhyāya's information about the Cārvāka's theory of causation</i>	128
<i>Hume on the impossibility of perceiving (senses) and of demonstrating (reason) a relation of causality. Hume's denial of the theoretical validity of the idea of cause</i>	134
<i>Remarks concerning ananyathāsiddhi and Aristotle cause per accidens</i>	138
<i>Udayana's refutation of the Cārvāka denial of causality: The five theses implied in this denial. Hume's remarks on hetuniṣedha and svavidhi</i>	139
<i>The fifth thesis: the svabhāvavāda or own nature theory</i>	144
<i>Some testimonies on the own nature theory</i>	145
<i>Characteristics of the own nature theory according to the quoted texts</i>	148
<i>The Materialistic and Atheistic Cārvāka doctrines and some parallel accounts in ancient Greece</i>	151
<i>The refutation of the svabhāva theory by Udayana</i>	155

<i>Antecedence of the cause and contiguity of cause and effect in Udayana. Hume on this matter</i>	159
<i>Necessary existence of the cause. Causality according to Udayana</i>	160
<i>The importance of 'niyama' and 'anupakāra' in Udayana's and in modern Western theories of causation</i>	168
<i>Udayana's, the Cārvāka's, and Hume's notions of cause/effect relation</i>	171
References	175